

# TERRITORIAL QUALITY INCOME: From French Theory to Brazilian Studies

http://dx.doi.org/10.21527/2237-6453.2024.61.16116

Submitted: June 19, 2024 Accepted: August 1, 2024

Ivoneti da Silva Ramos<sup>1</sup>; Valério Alécio Turnes<sup>2</sup>; Ademir Antônio Cazella<sup>3</sup>; Bernard Pecqueur<sup>4</sup>

#### **ABSTRACT**

Researchers studying the crisis of French agricultural regions at the end of the 20th century observed the use of specific territorial resources. This practice led to differentiated goods and services that gave rise to the theoretical-methodological framework of the Basket of Territorial Goods and Services (BTGS). Stimulated by the collective organization of local actors, this initiative proved to be a promising development alternative. Furthermore, these specific goods and services promoted differentiated income, a phenomenon that led to the theory of Territorial Quality Income (TQI). This opened the agenda for research on BTGS in various countries, including Brazil. However, the same did not happen with the topic of TQI. Although conceptually mentioned in various articles, the application of the concept still lacks further development. In this context, this article aims to highlight the topic of TQI based on the French experience and analyze the possibilities for generating this type of income in rural Brazilian territories. The methodological procedure applied was a literature review of TQI theory and case studies on the BTGS framework conducted in rural Brazilian territories. In all the case studies analyzed, there is an appreciation of territorial goods and services, which raises the possibility of investigating the generation of TQI, thus opening a future research agenda in Brazilian contexts.

**Keywords:** sustainable territorial development; territorial quality income; basket of territorial goods and services; specific resources.

#### RENDA DE QUALIDADE TERRITORIAL: DA TEORIA FRANCESA AOS ESTUDOS BRASILEIROS

### **RESUMO**

Ao estudar regiões agrícolas francesas em crise no final do século 20, pesquisadores observaram que algumas áreas rurais ativaram recursos territoriais específicos, resultando em bens e serviços diferenciados que deram origem ao enfoque teórico-metodológico da Cesta de Bens e Serviços Territoriais (CBST). Estimulada pela organização coletiva de atores locais, esta iniciativa revelou-se uma alternativa promissora de desenvolvimento. Além disso, esses bens e serviços específicos promoviam um rendimento diferenciado, fenômeno que originou a teoria da Renda de Qualidade Territorial (RQT). Abriu-se, então, a agenda para pesquisas sobre a CBST em diversos países, entre eles o Brasil. O mesmo não ocorreu com o tema da RQT. Embora conceitualmente mencionada em diversos artigos, a aplicação do conceito ainda carece de aprofundamento. Nesse contexto, este artigo objetiva dar visibilidade ao tema da RQT a partir da experiência francesa e analisar as possibilidades de geração desse tipo de renda em territórios rurais brasileiros. O procedimento metodológico aplicado foi revisão bibliográfica sobre a teoria da RQT e de estudos de caso sobre o enfoque da CBST realizados em territórios rurais brasileiros. Em todos os estudos de caso analisados há valorização de bens e serviços territoriais, o que suscita a possibilidade de investigação da geração de RQT, abrindo uma agenda futura de pesquisa em contextos brasileiros.

**Palavras-chave**: desenvolvimento territorial sustentável; recursos específicos; renda de qualidade territorial; cesta de bens e serviços territoriais.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Santa Catarina State University – UDESC. Florianópolis/SC, Brazil. https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5417-3490

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Santa Catarina State University – UDESC. Florianópolis/SC, Brazil. https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2923-341X

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Santa Catarina State University – UDESC. Florianópolis/SC, Brazil. https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4457-4853

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Université Grenoble Alpes. France. https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4986-0349



Ivoneti da Silva Ramos – Valério Alécio Turnes – Ademir Antônio Cazella – Bernard Pecqueur

#### INTRODUCTION

The crises of the late 20th century in rural regions facing competitive challenges due to natural factors created a scenario that required new coping strategies. Researchers Amédée Mollard and Bernard Pecqueur observed that local social actors in economically struggling areas of France cooperatively mobilized production factors specific to their territories. The collective supply of differentiated goods and services in these regions gave rise to the theoretical-methodological framework known as the basket of territorial goods and services (BTGS), which emerged as a promising development strategy. These specific goods and services generated a distinct income, leading to the formulation of the theory of territorial quality income (TQI).

The BTGS represents a collection of goods and services rooted in territorial resources, including know-how, infrastructure, and historical, cultural, and natural heritage, among other factors that contribute to both quality of life and economic appeal (Pecqueur, 2001; Hirczak et al., 2008). TQI, in turn, refers to the income generated through the joint valorization of these territorial goods and services (Mollard, 2001; Pecqueur, 2001). In essence, BTGS brings together the resources of a territory, while TQI reflects the economic benefit derived from optimizing and enhancing them.

This article highlights TQI based on the French experience and explores its potential in the Brazilian context, encouraging further studies. It is structured into six sections, including this introduction. The next section outlines the methodological framework, followed by two sections discussing the theoretical-methodological approaches of BTGS and TQI, drawing on the pioneering work of French researchers. The fifth section examines studies on this topic in Brazil and considers the potential for expanding research on TQI within the country. The final section provides concluding remarks.

# **METHODOLOGICAL ASPECTS**

Territorial goods and services arise from the interactions among public, private, and associative agents within a given space in relationships establishing differentiated income patterns. According to Pecqueur (2001) and Mollard (2001), this new income pattern is known as territorial quality income (TQI). This article focuses on these relationships and falls within the realm of socio-spatial research, which, as Kapp (2020, p. 3) explains, "addresses society, space, and their interrelationships." The main methodological approach was a bibliographic review of French theoretical and empirical studies on BTGS and TQI, followed by an analysis of case studies that apply these frameworks to rural Brazilian territories. Data collection involved a bibliographic survey to compile the initial corpus for the study, which, according to Bauer and Aarts (2002), consists of a set of sources and materials that form the foundation of the research.

The theoretical and methodological foundations of BTGS and TQI originated from studies conducted by researchers analyzing territorial development planning at the Laboratory of Interdisciplinary Social Sciences at the University of Grenoble Alpes. In the first stage of the bibliographic survey, materials were selected based on the references provided by these researchers, focusing on publications addressing BTGS and TQI approaches, particularly those that analyzed both themes. This stage resulted in the selection of 12 articles published between 1997 and 2012.



Ivoneti da Silva Ramos – Valério Alécio Turnes – Ademir Antônio Cazella – Bernard Pecqueur

The second stage of the survey involved searches on the Periódicos Capes and Google Scholar platforms, without language or time restrictions, using the following keywords: "renda de qualidade territorial" (territorial quality income) and "cesta de bens e serviços territoriais" (basket of territorial goods and services), "recursos específicos" (specific resources) and "desenvolvimento territorial sustentável" (sustainable territorial development)<sup>5</sup>. While no relevant materials were found in the Capes Periodicals portal, Google Scholar yielded six articles published between 2017 and 2023, which aligned with the objectives of this study and were selected for analysis.

In total, 18 articles were identified that directly addressed the core themes of this study. Additional references from related studies were also included to complement the research.

# TERRITORIES, SPECIFIC RESOURCES AND ASSETS, AND THE BASKET OF TERRITORIAL GOODS AND SERVICES

The first publications addressing the theoretical-methodological approach of the basket of territorial goods and services (BTGS) and territorial quality income (TQI) theory date back to the 1990s. The BTGS approach represents a collective and differentiated strategy for territorial development adopted by a multi-actor collective, while TQI is a correlated theory arising from the appreciation of specific territorial resources. A key aspect of this approach is the specificity of territorial goods and services, which requires an initial definition of the relationship between territory and specific resources, distinguishing them from generic resources and assets.

According to Mollard (2001), in the process of social construction of territories<sup>6</sup>, resources are transformed into specific assets, which is essential for creating differentiated goods. Sabourin (2002, p. 25) further notes that the territorial approach emphasizes "the collective and negotiated appreciation of the potential of localities, communities, or regions, known as local attributes or specific assets." Generally, resources are latent factors to be revealed and developed, while assets are active resources. Generic resources and assets are fully transferable and hold exchange value, whereas specific resources and assets have unique, non-transferable qualities directly connected to the territory in which they are situated. According to Benko; Pecqueur, 2001), there are limitations to replicating these resources in other places. These distinctions illustrate that what is sold locally is not just products and services but, in a sense, the territory itself becomes a "product" (Mollard, 2001). This process emerges from the contributions of social actors across various professional sectors, incorporating additional elements such as environmental amenities (e.g., landscapes, climates), traditional knowledge, and historical and cultural factors.

In short, specific assets arise from the value attributed to a particular resource through a collective construction process (Benko; Pecqueur, 2001); this activation process assumes the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> In these queries, the expressions were placed in quotation marks to identify studies addressing both themes. Additionally, the Boolean operator AND was used to find studies that include the intersection of the searched words or expressions.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The concept that permeates this study is that of "constructed territory," whose formation represents the result of a process of construction and delimitation by social actors. This characteristic differentiates it from the given territory with a political-administrative delimitation (Pecqueur, 2006).



Ivoneti da Silva Ramos – Valério Alécio Turnes – Ademir Antônio Cazella – Bernard Pecqueur

existence of "a valorization project (like the wind, before the invention of windmills, or the curves on the climb of Alpe d'Huez before the invention of the Tour de France)" (Janin; Perron, 2016, p. 20).

Specific assets contribute to territorial development<sup>7</sup> by strengthening a territory's capacity to use its resources efficiently and innovatively, forming the foundation for building and implementing development strategies. A territory's uniqueness is defined by its specific assets, which cannot exist independently of the conditions in which they are produced. The transformation of territorial resources into specific territorial assets is central to the BTGS theoretical and methodological approach.

Lacroix, Mollard, and Pecqueur (1997) analyzed the diversity of contributions of territorial resources in the supply and demand of quality goods and services across different territories. The identification of a composite and specific supply of goods and services anchored in a particular territory laid the foundation for the BTGS approach. Among the territories studied, the Baronnies region in France gained particular visibility. A rural mountainous area where post-war modernization and mechanization failed to boost productivity significantly, Baronnies displayed a set of territorialized goods and services, collectively referred to as a basket of goods and services. The "Baronnies basket" was composed of olive oil – with protected designation of origin and produced from ancient trees grown on terraces – as well as local wines, rural tourism, essential oils, and aromatic plants (Lacroix; Mollard; Pecqueur, 1997). A critical element observed in Baronnies was the network of local actors surrounding production and supply, which ensured the sustainability of the BTGS and TQI.

This led to what is known as the "basket effect," wherein the purchase of a territorial-quality product attracts consumers to buy other territorial goods or services. This joint appreciation of the territory's intrinsic qualities and the excellence of its products and services generates a differentiated income known as TQI(Mollard; Pecqueur; Lacroix, 2000). TQI arises from this diverse and combined offer, which relies on constructing a territorial governance system (Pecqueur, 2001). Three main components of the basket explain the formation of TQI:

(i) A collection of complementary goods and services that strengthen local markets; (ii) A mix of private and public goods that enhance the territory's image and reputation for quality; (iii) A territorial governance system formed through the coordinated interaction among basket producers, allowing public, private, and associative actors to internalize territorial quality income.

The price of olive oil from Baronnies exemplifies how territorial value can drive income differentiation. Lacroix, Mollard, and Pecqueur (1997) found that although production costs and typologies were similar across regions—such as extra virgin olive oil, first cold pressing, with acidity below 1%—Baronnies olive oil consistently commanded a higher price, resulting in increased income levels. This was despite the fact that production conditions were comparable, global demand for olive oil had surged in recent decades, and other products, like Nyon olive oil (protected by geographical indication since the 1960s), also enjoyed such status. So, what accounted for this price discrepancy?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> For an in-depth exploration of the concepts and methodological aspects of territorial development, see Dallabrida et al. (2021).



Ivoneti da Silva Ramos – Valério Alécio Turnes – Ademir Antônio Cazella – Bernard Pecqueur

The authors argue that the difference cannot be attributed solely to the intrinsic qualities of the olive oil (production methods, olive quality, flavor, etc.). Instead, it was linked to its association with other goods and services within the Baronnies basket (the "basket effect") and consumer preferences for the region itself. This phenomenon is a positive externality that arises from the complementary products and services offered, benefiting the various stakeholders involved (Lacroix; Mollard; Pecqueur, 1997).

Hirczak et al. (2008) point out that the configuration of the basket of products and services is fragile and ongoing, requiring continuous effort. Among the territories analyzed, Baronnies was considered the closest case to an ideal BTGS model. The authors compared this with the Chablais region (France), which produced wines and cheeses and offered tourism services. However, the difference between the two regions lies in the fact that, in Baronnies, the products within the basket generated a collective income, known as the "basket effect," supported by production and supply networks that contributed to a differentiated income. In contrast, in Chablais, the dispersed supply of goods and services did not produce the same synergistic effect (Lacroix; Mollard; Pecqueur, 1997; Mollard, 2001; Pecqueur, 2001).

In Chablais, territorial governance – particularly the coordination among public, private, and associative actors essential for creating basket synergy – was underdeveloped. While this did not negate the territorial value of Chablais's goods and services, it did prevent the region from fully aligning with the "pure model" of the BTGS. Table 1 below outlines the different basket models derived from studies on the BTGS approach, with a particular focus on the pure model (the Baronnies Basket).

Table 1 – Basket and territorial goods and services models

Basket model	Description
i. Basket	It is based on the Baronnies case. It has been observed in other territories, such
	as Aubrac, where specific and complementary products reinforce each other.
ii. Hybrid basket	Characterized by the coexistence of generic and sectoral production systems
	and quality local products associated with tradition.
iii. Top-down basket	Originated in institutional strategies of public, regional, or departmental actors.
iv. Basket of	It has some similarities with the top-down basket but with greater impermeability between public, private, and associative actors.
juxtaposed	
initiatives	

Source: Based on Hirczak et al. (2008) and Cazella et al. (2020).

In the basket model, the *Laguiole* cheese from Aubrac demonstrates a favorable price differential and significant income potential, attributed to the genetic selection efforts aimed at reintroducing the Aubrac breed, as well as its association with the tradition of the *Laguiole* knife and the classic *aligot* dish (Hirczak et al., 2008; Cazella et al., 2020). According to Hirczak et al. (2008, p. 9), "[...] Aubrac shares many similarities with the Baronnies basket of goods: a specific product offer (cheese, knife, aligot), complemented by rural tourism services [...]". In this context, the conditions necessary for the basket effect to occur and enhance the generation of TQI align closely with the "pure" basket model.

Conversely, in the hybrid basket model, the potential for higher income generation may be undermined by competition from other goods and services that possess similar characteristics but are offered at lower prices, along with challenges in engaging local stakeholders to



Ivoneti da Silva Ramos – Valério Alécio Turnes – Ademir Antônio Cazella – Bernard Pecqueur

collaboratively create the basket. This situation could even lead to the decline of traditional products. The top-down basket model, as illustrated by a case study in the Ardèche department of France, involves public institutions coordinating various initiatives under the territorial brand "Deguste Ardèche." This branding enables the name "Ardèche" to designate the origin of high-quality products and services from the region. The supply of quality, diverse, and specific products – such as wines, nuts, fruits, cheeses, meats, and mineral waters – is enhanced by complementary quality services related to the environment, culture, heritage, and tourism. In this model, governance operates from the top down and relies on public stakeholders.

The juxtaposed basket model potentially offers territorialized resources and goods and services appreciated collectively; however, it lacks synergistic coordination among public, private, and associative actors (Hirczak et al., 2008). As detailed in models ii, iii, and iv in Table 1, the basket effect is less likely to materialize due to challenges in coordinating territorial actors to organize a unified offering. Nonetheless, does this pose a limitation when generating TQI? It is understood that TQI does not depend solely on the basket effect; it can arise from both synergistic (basket effect) and dispersed offerings, as highlighted by Mollard (2001).

Thus, difficulties in coordinating local actors do not preclude the generation of TQI, although effective territorial governance remains a crucial component for sustaining this type of income. Without collaboration among local stakeholders, the regional product risks losing its value or even becoming extinct due to competition from generic alternatives, such as Bresse blue cheese (Bleu de Bresse) in France (hybrid basket). This product has entered international competition with other generic industrial cheeses, diminishing its association with territorial specificity, leading to price equalization, and eroding the unique value of the territory (Hirczak et al., 2008).

Two additional advantages offered by the BTGS approach for generating TQI are the broader appropriation of this income by a greater number of producers and service providers of territorial quality and the increased magnitude of income generated. However, the lack of empirical studies on these aspects is linked to the methodological challenges of quantifying TQI.

# THE THEORY OF TERRITORIAL QUALITY INCOME

Mollard's study (2001) has become a seminal reference on this subject. The author clarifies that the term territorial quality income (TQI) embodies the interplay between two distinct types of income, taking into account the specific contexts in which each theory was developed: (i) territorial income, adapted from the pioneering formulations of David Ricardo (1772-1823), who examined land income and the role of natural resources and their scarcity in generating income through lower production costs; and (ii) quality income, drawing inspiration from Alfred Marshall (1842-1924), who broadened the concept to encompass factors emerging from the Industrial Revolution, particularly in relation to demand characteristics.

In this context, studies on territorial income integrate elements of differential rent from Ricardian theory. Ricardo's formulations emerged during a time when agriculture (the primary sector) was the predominant income-generating activity. In contrast, contemporary researchers of goods and services investigate realities that have evolved since the Second World War, where income is generated across the primary, secondary (industry), and tertiary (commerce and



Ivoneti da Silva Ramos – Valério Alécio Turnes – Ademir Antônio Cazella – Bernard Pecqueur

services) sectors. According to Ricardo (2001), the differential income of products is linked to the price surplus at equal costs, considering the scarcity of non-reproducible factors (such as land and location), diminishing returns, and inelastic supply. When exploring the relationship between TQI and Ricardian differential income, Mollard (2001) notes that territorial income is derived from the price surplus above the average cost for heterogeneous products. These products lack close substitutes, cannot be reproduced (due to preferences for a specific territory, public and private goods, and intrinsic as well as constructed resources), and exhibit the inelastic nature of supply.

By adapting this framework to contemporary realities, the notion of land rent is supplanted by the concept of territorial income. For Mollard (2001, p. 5):

[...] territorial income is possible when a good anchor in a given space becomes a rare or non-reproducible factor. Such income is of the same nature as Ricardian differential income, i.e., it results from the difference between two observable prices in the market for the goods and services considered. At equal cost, prices are higher than a comparable local supply elsewhere (for example, prices of coastal land, prices of second homes, or rural homes, etc.).

Concerning quality income, Mollard (2001, p. 19) explains that a strategy employed by sectors to cope with the pressures of international competition was to "enhance their supply by producing differentiated, non-reproducible goods and services to escape cost-based competition." This includes goods and services with territorial specificities, which command a premium price due to the valorization of their unique attributes, as evidenced by the example of Nyons olive oil. For consumers, the value they derive from purchasing a specific olive oil often exceeds the price they are willing to pay, even if that price is higher than the market average.

In this context, Mollard (2001) connects TQI with Marshallian theory, positing that consumer surplus arises when the market price is lower than the expected benefit derived from the value the consumer is willing to pay for the product. This explanation aligns with the notion that specific territorial assets encompass not only production costs but also environmental, landscape, historical, and cultural attributes, rendering them unique and differentiated products. These characteristics can generate a greater surplus for consumers, leading to inelastic demand driven by their preference for such resources.

This process radically changes the market laws in which the products and services are inserted: there is a shift from the law of supply and demand to "consent to pay." (...) The value created and distributed to producers is no longer a result of the "quantitative productivity of labor" used in the elaboration of production but rather the price accepted by consumers for these specific products (Campagne, 2016).

Building on these two foundational approaches, Mollard (2001) aimed to redefine the income differential associated with territorial qualification. This redefinition entails a strategic integration of producers and service providers on the supply side (territorial income) and consumers on the demand side (quality income). Mollard emphasizes that only through the combination of territorial income and quality income can TQI be realized.

Following Mollard's initial exploration, Mollard et al. (2003) further analyze research findings related to the Baronnies territory, reinforcing the hypothesis surrounding the basket of territorial goods and services. They highlight the TQI generated from the sale price of olive oil.



Ivoneti da Silva Ramos – Valério Alécio Turnes – Ademir Antônio Cazella – Bernard Pecqueur

According to the authors, this differentiated income arises primarily from the interplay between product quality and territorial identity: differentiation by quality coupled with differentiation by territory. When these two sources of differentiation align, TQI is created. As the authors state (2003, p. 2):

TQI reflects the actors' ability to create institutional processes capable of capturing consumers willing to pay the price associated with the product's environment. Territorial quality income is an organizational income: its development results from a long-term territorial strategy involving producers, processors, and cooperatives, as well as institutions for coordinating local development (development unions, local authorities, etc.). An income capable of identifying a constructed supply of specific goods or services.

Following the pioneering analysis of the subject, Bérard et al. (2005) presented a case study on the basket of territorial goods and services in the Bresse region of France. While the region has modernized its agriculture, it maintains traditional productions that are heterogeneous and lack a cohesive system of territorial governance. The authors conclude that a coexistence of generic and specific productions exists in this territory, making it challenging to generate TQI on a broader scale, with the exception of a small association of poultry producers.

Building on these reflections, Mollard, Rambonilaza, and Vollet (2006) analyzed tourism services to demonstrate the existence of TQI. These services are characterized by their local consumption, making location a central feature for both demand and supply. Adopting the hedonic pricing method<sup>8</sup> and econometric analysis of prices in the tourist accommodation market, the authors found that environmental variables complement the intrinsic characteristics of accommodation in differentiation strategies.

Roux, Vollet, and Pecqueur (2006) discussed another crucial aspect in generating TQI: the strategic convergence of actors that can create a specific location supply, thereby enhancing the value of territorial resources. They argue that territorial governance expands and strengthens the basket of territorial goods and services based on individual, collective, or institutional private logic. In their case studies of the Baronnies and Aubrac territories, they identified a convergence of sectoral and territorial governance for the olive oil and cheese sectors but not for the fruit and cutlery sectors.

Pecqueur (2006) contrasts a standard model of economic performance based on productivity with a model centered on "quality." This latter model establishes a new competitive relationship, not between companies, but between productive sites (territories). By emphasizing the advantages that can arise from this shift in perspective – adding local products to networked territorial production – Pecqueur grounds his analysis on the effects of territorial quality income.

The study by Hirczak et al. (2008) evaluates a decade of research on the basket model, emphasizing the growing interactions between quality products and services, the environment, and territories as sources of positive externalities that can be leveraged for sustainable territorial development. It is essential to note that TQI and the theoretical-methodological framework of the basket of territorial goods and services are still evolving concepts. The authors acknowledge

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Hedonic pricing (or implicit pricing) is a method of evaluating goods based on Lancaster's hypothesis, published in 1966, that "the attributes of a given commodity have value because they provide utility to those who consume them" (Ferreira; Resende Filho, 2010, p. 473).



Ivoneti da Silva Ramos – Valério Alécio Turnes – Ademir Antônio Cazella – Bernard Pecqueur

the difficulty in finding an ideal model, asserting that each case must be examined based on its unique characteristics. This aligns with Mollard's (2001) observation regarding the methodological challenges inherent in evaluating territorial quality income. At this stage, while TQI is acknowledged to exist, its quantification lacks established procedures.

Over the years, new studies employing the basket of territorial goods and services (BTGS) approach have emerged, led by researchers from various countries, including Brazil, as well as ongoing work by French authors focusing on other global contexts. Pecqueur (2022) discusses territorial resources as opportunities for promoting development in the global South. He highlights the challenges economically developing rural areas face when transitioning to a market system with large-scale production, particularly in terms of integrating family farming and attracting investment. One strategy involves valuing territorial resources that can generate differentiated income linked to territorial quality based on the market's assessment of these resources. This includes promoting "things" that have not previously been marketed, such as landscapes, heritage, history, know-how, and locally produced products (Pecqueur, 2022).

# STUDIES ON BTGS AND TERRITORIAL QUALITY INCOME IN BRAZIL

In Brazil, numerous studies explore the theme of territorial development. A bibliographic survey reveals that while both the basket of territorial goods and services (BTGS) and territorial quality income (TQI) are discussed in various publications, analyses predominantly emphasize the BTGS perspective. The most consistent research on these approaches has originated in the rural areas of Santa Catarina. Beginning in 2016, members of the Laboratory for Studies of Agricultural and Territorial Multifunctionality (Lemate) at the Federal University of Santa Catarina (UFSC) systematically coordinated research projects employing the theoretical-methodological framework of BTGS<sup>9</sup>. It is essential to note that this section does not encompass the entirety of the research conducted on the subject in Brazil<sup>10</sup>.

Cazella et al. (2019) analyzed the region of Serra Catarinense in the state of Santa Catarina, southern Brazil, identifying several elements of BTGS, including artisanal mountain cheese, fuji apples, high-altitude wines, honeydew honey from Bracatinga, and rural tourism. These elements indicate the potential for constructing a diverse supply of quality products and services. The authors highlight that the absence of a territorial governance system capable

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> This article is a partial outcome of several research projects, including: 1) "The Approach to the Basket of Territorial Goods and Services: Analysis Model for Sustainable Territorial Development" (CNPq Universal Notice); 2) "Sustainable Territorial Development: Interfaces Between the Basket of Goods and Services, Markets, and Territorial Brands" (Santa Catarina Research and Innovation Support Foundation, FAPESC Public Call 12/2020, Universal Research Program). 3)"Innovation and Sustainable Transition: Basket of Goods and Services in Amazonian Territories" (Confap Public Call Notice 003/2022, Amazon Initiative +10 Research Project Support Program, financed by FAPESC, Grant Term 2022TR002173); 4) "Sustainable Territorial Development: The Basket of Goods and Services, Markets, and Territorial Brands" (CNPq Research Productivity Grant Notice – PQ 2022); and 5) "Integrative Project: Coproduction, Accountability, and Innovation: Dilemmas and Perspectives in Contemporary Public Administration" by the Politeia Research Group, which received funding from FAPESC and the Santa Catarina State University (UDESC), under Public Call Notice – PAP FAPESC 48/2022, supporting infrastructure for UDESC research groups (Grant Term 2023TR000519), valid from 2023 to 2025.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup>A pioneering study in Brazil that employs the BTGS approach was conducted by Flexor and Benavides (2009), focusing on agricultural multifunctionality. Their empirical research was carried out on the southern coast of Rio de Janeiro.



Ivoneti da Silva Ramos – Valério Alécio Turnes – Ademir Antônio Cazella – Bernard Pecqueur

of fostering synergies among ongoing initiatives is the weakest component of this landscape. While the study does not directly address the basket effect or TQI, it remains one of the closest analyses to the basket model, suggesting that the appreciation of territorial goods and services in that region serves as a foundation for future TQI studies.

Subsequently, Cazella et al. (2020, p. 193) advanced the theoretical framework of the BTGS approach, emphasizing factors that limit its application in territorial development studies in Brazil. Their conclusions reflect the importance of incorporating social inclusion, networking, territorial governance systems, institutional investments, and training social actors to navigate the complexities of sustainable territorial development within Brazil's social context.<sup>11</sup>

In addressing the concept of TQI, the authors emphasize the fact that this income in Brazil must not be understood solely as a consequence of rising prices for quality territorial products and services aimed at consumers with higher purchasing power. They argue that an exclusive focus on increasing prices can lead to the exclusion of many consumers. Instead, they propose that TQI can be achieved through increased sales volume rather than solely through price hikes, particularly by leveraging territorial market marketing channels to benefit local consumers. Although their study does not engage deeply with the theoretical discourse on TQI, the authors emphasize the need for future research to develop a model for measuring TQI, which is crucial for demonstrating its socioeconomic significance (Cazella et al., 2020).

The study by Medeiros, Sablayrolles, and Cazella (2021, p. 14) further connects the BTGS approach with the concept of producing novelties, drawing on empirical evidence from the Tapajós National Forest (Flona) in western Pará (North of Brazil). Their findings highlight various specific territorial assets, such as wooden furniture, bio-jewels, vegetable leather crafts, liqueurs, food products, and tourism offerings. Additionally, the authors note the emergence of an incipient territorial governance system that has already begun to address social inclusion for segments of the Flona population not engaged in formal territorial development initiatives. This analysis reveals that a portion of the TQI is allocated to community social actions led by a cooperative organization coordinating many initiatives to enhance specific territorial resources.

Tecchio et al. (2021) analyze the application of the BTGS theoretical-methodological approach by identifying goods and services that can be integrated into a development strategy for the Association of Municipalities of the West of Santa Catarina (Ameosc). The findings indicate that the most prominent goods and services include the Oktoberfest celebration, which showcases the culture of German immigrants in the municipality of Itapiranga, alongside colonial products primarily transformed into artisanal family agro-industries across the 19 municipalities in Ameosc. Additionally, initiatives surrounding native corn and popcorn seeds, particularly from social actors in the municipality of Anchieta, are linked to promising rural adventure and historical-cultural tourism efforts. Other municipalities in the region have invested in facilities for leisure events, further enhanced by the unique positioning of the triple border between Brazil, Argentina, and Paraguay. Similar to previous studies, the results underscore the necessity of fostering synergies among various activities to effectively delineate territorial quality resources.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup>Additional studies further support the findings from French analyses while expanding the reflections on the topic. For instance, De Paula (2019) examines the BTGS in Serra Catarinense and highlights the fragility of the governance system – a critical component of both the basket approach and TQI.



Ivoneti da Silva Ramos – Valério Alécio Turnes – Ademir Antônio Cazella – Bernard Pecqueur

In these instances, characteristics of hybrid or juxtaposed basket models emerge, featuring territorialized goods and services that can lay the groundwork for TQI studies.

Turnes et al. (2022) developed an initial panel of indicators to monitor the construction of a basket of territorial goods and services. This panel aims to evaluate both temporal changes within a territory and the specific aspects that may be common or unique to individual baskets. For the authors, these indicators work as training tools for social actors within the BTGS framework. The panel categorizes dimensions such as the supply of quality private products and services, quality public goods, and the territorial governance system, breaking them down into descriptors and indicators. While it does not directly address TQI, this panel marks a significant advancement in the study of this theoretical-methodological approach and offers inspiration for future indicators related to TQI (Turnes et al., 2022).

Froehlich and Roque (2022) present a reinterpretation of the development process in the Quarta Colônia territory, which consists of nine municipalities in central Rio Grande do Sul, from a BTGS perspective. Since the 1990s, initiatives have been launched to promote traditional Italian cuisine, artisanal agri-food production, and ecological and cultural tourism. Specific territorial resources tied to history, culture, and nature have received support through public actions coordinated by the Quarta Colônia Sustainable Development Consortium. Gastronomy has emerged as a key territorial asset, establishing itself as a leading product in the territory's basket (Froehlich & Roque, 2022).

However, the analysis reveals challenges in territorial governance, particularly in recent years, leading to a trend where a limited group of social actors increasingly appropriates TQI. In this context, the basket model may resemble a top-down approach dominated by public actors. While the article does not focus specifically on TQI, it opens avenues for future research to explore this topic in greater depth.

Dorigon (2022) connects the concepts of BTGS and TQI with the notion of "symbolic sites of belonging." The BTGS approach emphasizes the identification and valorization of specific territorial resources and assets through markets, aiming to generate TQI. In contrast, the concept of symbolic sites of belonging integrates various dimensions of economic and social coordination, with markets representing just one aspect. The author argues that the sense of belonging to a particular territory and culture can enhance the value of products and services, emphasizing territorial attributes such as landscapes, cultural practices, and the historical narratives of specific social groups. The networks of relationships and practices among local actors reaffirm the importance of effective territorial governance. While the study addresses TQI, further research is needed to explore the associations between this type of income and symbolic sites of belonging, particularly regarding informal food marketing channels that contribute to generating and sustaining TQI.

Two studies specifically address TQI in Brazil. Ramos, Turnes, and Cazella (2022) present an overview of TQI, drawing on French literature to incorporate this topic into Brazil's research agenda. Building on the insights of Cazella et al. (2020), the authors discuss data that highlight differences between the two countries regarding economic, fiscal, public policy, and human development factors. This reflection is further developed in Ramos, Turnes, and Cazella (2023), which examines an initiative in the western region of Santa Catarina focused on family agribusi-



Ivoneti da Silva Ramos – Valério Alécio Turnes – Ademir Antônio Cazella – Bernard Pecqueur

nesses. The authors highlight the generation of differentiated income that values intangible territorial resources and advocate for more in-depth research in this area.

The Brazilian studies analyzed contribute to a more nuanced inventory of territorial goods and services and demonstrate that TQI, though still in the early stages of investigation, represents a central theme in theoretical formulations of territorial development. Pecqueur (2024) highlights the current relevance of territorial food systems, particularly family agribusinesses involved in food transformation, which primarily sell their products in local markets. According to the author, these small family agro-industrial units are integral to reconnecting production with the territory and generating income distinguished by its territorial quality.

# FINAL CONSIDERATIONS

The concept of territorial quality income (TQI) emerged in the 1990s and, in applied research, remains primarily focused on the French socioeconomic context while being relatively underexplored in the broader literature on territorial development. Numerous initiatives aimed at enhancing the value of specific territorial resources in rural areas across various countries often lack quantitative economic references demonstrating their significance to public managers and the general population.

Against this backdrop, this article emphasizes the topic of TQI by drawing on the pioneering work of French researchers and exploring its potential in territorial development initiatives in Brazil. The French perspective offers a strategy for promoting territorial development by linking the basket of territorial goods and services (BTGS) approach with the generation of TQI. In Brazil, while the BTGS approach has been applied in empirical studies, research on TQI is still in its early stages. This is largely due to the absence of a detailed analytical model outlining the methodological procedures needed to assess and quantify this type of income.

The analysis of Brazilian studies enabled the correlation of various basket models systematized by French authors: the basket in the Serra Catarinense region and western Pará; the hybrid or juxtaposed basket in the West of Santa Catarina; and the top-down basket in Quarta Colônia in the state of Rio Grande do Sul. This indicates that TQI has a place on Brazil's research agenda. Furthermore, recent French studies highlight the potential to deepen TQI research in the context of family agribusinesses, particularly in their integration into territorial markets. In all Brazilian case studies referenced in this article, the valorization of specific, high-quality territorial goods and services was evident, presenting opportunities for further exploration into TQI generation. In conclusion, there is room to develop a research agenda and potentially propose a TQI measurement model tailored to the Brazilian context.

# **REFERENCES**

BAUER, M. W.; AARTS, B..A construção do corpus: um princípio para a coleta de dados qualitativos. [In]: BAUER, martin; GASKELL, George (org.). Pesquisa qualitativa com texto, imagem e som. Petrópolis: Vozes, 2002.

BENKO, G.; PECQUEUR, B.. Os recursos de territórios e os territórios de recursos. Geosul, Florianópolis, v.16, n.32, p 31-50, jul./dez. 2001. Disponível em: https://periodicos.ufsc.br/index.php/geosul/article/view/14006. Acesso em dez. 2023.



Ivoneti da Silva Ramos – Valério Alécio Turnes – Ademir Antônio Cazella – Bernard Pecqueur

BÉRARD, L., HIRCZAK, M., MARCHENAY; MOLLAR, A..; PECQUEUR, B.. Le panier de biens: une construction patrimoniale et territoriale. L'exemple de la Bresse. Symposium international INRA - PSDR: Lyon, 17 p., 2005. Disponível em: file:///C:/Users/voner/Downloads/Le\_panier\_de\_biens\_une\_construction\_patrimoniale e-1.pdf. Acesso em jul. 2023.

CAMPAGNE, P. Les territoires créatifs face à mondialisation: l'exemple de territoires ruraux des pays méditerranéens. In: GLON, E.; PECQUEUR, B. Au cœur des territoires créatifs: proximités et ressources territoriales. Rennes: PressesUniversitaires de Rennes, p. 201-2012, 2016.

CAZELLA, A. A.; DE PAULA, L. G. N.; MEDEIROS, M.; TURNES, V. A. A construção de um território de desenvolvimento rural: recursos e ativos territoriais específicos. Redes, Santa Cruz do Sul, v. 24, n. 3, p. 49-74, set. 2019.Disponível em: https://online.unisc.br/seer/index.php/redes/article/view/14118. Acesso em dez. 2023. DOI: https://doi.org/10.17058/redes.v24i3.14118.

CAZELLA, A. A.; MEDEIROS, M.; DESCONSI, C.; SCHNEIDER, S.; DE PAULA, L. G. N.. O enfoque da cesta de bens e serviços territoriais: seus fundamentos teóricos e aplicação no Brasil. Revista Brasileira de Gestão e Desenvolvimento Regional G&DR. V. 16, N. 3, P. 193-206, Taubaté, SP, set-dez/2020. Disponível em: https://www.rbgdr.net/revista/index.php/rbgdr/article/view/5881. Acesso em fev. 2024.

DALLABRIDA, V. R.; ROTTA, Edemar; BÜTTENBENDER, Pedro Luís; DENARDIN, Valdir Frigo; ARENHART, Livio Osvaldo. Abordagem territorial do desenvolvimento: categorias conceituais e pressupostos metodológicos. Revista Brasileira de Desenvolvimento Territorial Sustentável. GUAJU, Matinhos, v.7, n.1, p. 43-40, jan./jun. 2021. Disponível em: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/367877661\_ABORDAGEM\_TERRITORIAL\_DO\_DESENVOLVIMENTO\_CATEGORIAS\_CONCEITUAIS\_E\_PRESSUPOSTOS\_METODOLOGICOS. Acesso em maio 2024.

DE PAULA, Leandro Guimarães Nunes. Cesta de bens e serviços territoriais: uma possível estratégia de desenvolvimento territorial para a Serra Catarinense? Dissertação (mestrado). Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina, Centro de Ciências Agrárias, Programa de Pós Graduação em Agrossistemas, Florianópolis, 2019.

DORIGON, C. A teoria dos sítios simbólicos de pertencimento e as interfaces com o enfoque da Cesta de Bens e Serviços Territoriais. Raízes: Revista de Ciências Sociais e Econômicas, [S. I.], v. 42, n. 1, p. 114–133, 2022. DOI: 10.37370/raizes.2022.v42.782. Disponível em: https://raizes.revistas.ufcg.edu.br/index.php/raizes/article/view/782. Acesso em jun. 2024.

FERREIRA, Sandro de Freitas; RESENDE FILHO, Moisés de Andrade. Aplicação do Método de Preços Hedônicos na Precificação de Atributos Raros de Peças Filatélicas e Construção de Carteiras Eficientes. Est. Econ., são Paulo, v. 40, n. 2, P. 469-498, abril-junho 2010. https://doi.org/10.1590/S0101-41612010000200008.

FLEXOR, G.; BENAVIDES, Z. C. Multifuncionalidade da agricultura e diferenciação territorial no sul fluminense: uma perspectiva em termos de cesta de bens. In: CAZELLA. A. A.; BONNAL, P.; MALUF, R. S. Agricultura familiar: multifuncionalidade e desenvolvimento territorial no Brasil. Rio de Janeiro: Mauad X, p. 193-208, 2009.

FROEHLICH, J. M.; ROQUE, A. P. O Território Quarta Colônia sob o enfoque da Cesta de Bens e Serviços Territoriais: uma perspectiva histórica. Raízes: Revista de Ciências Sociais e Econômicas, [S. I.], v. 42, n. 1, p. 168–185, 2022. DOI: 10.37370/raizes.2022.v42.787. Disponível em: https://raizes.revistas.ufcg.edu.br/index.php/raizes/article/view/787. Acesso em jul. 2024.

GIL, A. C.. Métodos e Técnicas de Pesquisa Social. 6. ed. São Paulo: Atlas, 2008.

HIRCZAK, M.; PECQUEUR, B.; MOLLARD, A. .Le panier de biens et de services de qualite:versun modele de développement territorial durable?.MontagnesMediterraneennes, Institut deGeographie Alpine, 2004, Pp.35-42. Disponível em: https://shs.hal.science/halshs-00371256/document. Acesso em set. 2023.

HIRCZAK, M.; MOALLA, M.; MOLLARD, A.; PECQUEUR, B.; RAMBONILAZA, M.; VOLLET, D..Le modèle du panier de biens Grille d'analyse et observations de terrain. Économie Rurale. 2008. P. 50 -70. Disponível em: https://www.cairn.info/revue-economie-rurale-2008-6-page-55.htm. Acesso em ago. 2023. DOI: 10.4000/economierurale.366.

JANIN, C.; PERRON, L. Valorizar os recursos territoriais: chaves para a ação - guia metodológico. Florianópolis, SC: Epagri, 2020. 147 p. (Epagri, Documentos, 304). Tradução de: Domitila Madureira.

KAPP, Silke. Entrevista na pesquisa sócio-espacial. Revista Brasileira de Estudos Urbanos e Regionais v.22, e202006, 2020. Acesso em ago. 2023. DOI:10.22296/23171529.rbeur.202006.

LACROIX A.; MOLLARD A.; PECQUEUR, B..Association de Science Régionale de Langue Française. Faculté Des Sciences Economiques Et Sociales. La production d'une rente de qualité territorial e comme stratégie de développement: le cas des Baronnies. 33. Colloque: Renouveau régional, renouveau urbain, Sep 1997, Lille, France.



Ivoneti da Silva Ramos – Valério Alécio Turnes – Ademir Antônio Cazella – Bernard Pecqueur

LACROIX A.; MOLLARD A.; PECQUEUR, B..Politiques de développement local et rente de qualitéterritorialedesproduitsalimentaires. Journéesinternationales de la recherche pour la gestion des territoiresrurauxsensibles, Apr 1998, Clermond-Ferrand, France.

LACROIX A.; MOLLARD A.; PECQUEUR, B..Origine et produits de qualitéterritoriale: dusignal à l'attribut?. Revue d'ÉconomieRégionale et Urbaine, Armand Colin, 2000, p. 683-705.

MEDEIROS, M; SABLAYROLLES, P. J. L.; CAZELLA, A. A.. A configuração de Cesta de Bens e Serviços Territoriais como estratégia inovadora de desenvolvimento amazônico. Redes (St. Cruz Sul, Online), v.26, 2021. Disponível em: file:///C:/Users/voner/Downloads/16842-Texto%20do%20Artigo-75741-1-10-20220107. pdf. Acesso em out. 2023.

MOLLARD A.; PECQUEUR. B.; LACROIX A..A Meeting between Quality and Territorialism, the Rent Theory Reviewed in the Context of Territorial Development. International Journal of Sustainable Development (forthcoming), 2000.Disponívelem: https://ideas.repec.org/a/ids/ijsusd/v4y2001i4p368-391.html. Acesso em ago. 2023.

MOLLARD, A..Qualité et développementterritorial : une grille d'analysethéorique à partir de la rente. EconomieRurale, n°261, 2001, pp.16-34. Disponível em:https://www.persee.fr/doc/ecoru\_0013-0559\_2001\_num\_263\_1\_5240. Acesso em 21 mar. 2024. DOI :https://doi.org/10.3406/ecoru.2001.5240.

MOLLARD, A.; PECQUEUR, B.; HANUS, G.; ROYBIN, D.; GELIN, S..Valoriserlesqualitésspécifiquesdesterritoires:lepanier de biensdesBaronnies. Boletim Territoires, acteurs et agricultures en Rhône-Alpes – programme de recherches pour et sur le développement régional. 2003.

MOLLARD, A.; RAMBONILAZA, M.; VOLLET, D.. Aménitésenvironnementales et rente territoriale-surunmarché de servicesdifférenciés: lecasdumarchédesgîtesrurauxlabellisésen France. Revue d'ÉconomiePolitique, vol. 116, no. 2, 2006, p. 251-275. Disponível em: https://www.google.com/url?sa=t&source=web&rct=j&opi=89978449&url=https://www.cairn.info/load\_pdf.php%3Fdownload%-3D1%26ID\_ARTICLE%3DREDP\_162\_0251&ved=2ahUKEwiU-4fs2N6GAxXVq5UCHfp8AlgQFnoECBQQA-Q&usg=AOvVaw3uR-NrCrjbY4CD NYMGkk0. Acesso em set. 2023. DOI: 10.3917/redp.162.0251.

PECQUEUR, B.. Qualité et développement territorial: l'hypothèse du panier de biens et services territorialisés. Économie Rurale, vol. 261, no 1, p. 37-49, 2001. Disponível em : https://www.persee.fr/doc/ecoru\_0013-0559\_2001\_num\_261\_1\_5217. Acesso em ago. 2023. DOI :https://doi.org/10.3406/ecoru.2001.5217.

PECQUEUR, B. Le tournant territorial de l'économie globale. Espaces et Sociétés,n° 124-125, 2006, p. 17-32. Disponível em: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/229027150\_Le\_tournant\_territorial\_de\_l%27economie\_globale. Acessoem 12 fev. 2024.DOI:10.3917/esp.124.0017.

PECQUEUR, B. The territorial resource, an opportunity for local development in the South. Journal of Rural and Community Development, Montréal, 2022. Disponível em: https://journals.brandonu.ca/jrcd/article/view/2093. Acesso em set. 2023.

PECQUEUR, B. Can the territorial food system provide solutions to the recurring crises of the global food system? Italian Review of Agricultural Economics, Firenze University Press. (à paraître 2024)

RAMOS, I. S.; TURNES, V. A.; CAZELLA, A. A. Renda de qualidade territorial: Trajetória teórico-histórica francesa e reflexões da aplicação ao Brasil. Anais do VI SEDRES. Seminário de Desenvolvimento Regional, Estado e Sociedade. Crato — CE

06 a 08 de dezembro de 2022. Disponível em: http://www.urca.br/portal2/wp-content/uploads/2023/05/0001-ANAIS-VI-SEDRES-2022-FINALIZADO.pdf. Acesso em dez. 2023.

RAMOS, I. S.; TURNES, V. A.; CAZELLA, A. A..Renda de qualidade territorial no extremo oeste catarinense? abre-se uma agenda de investigação. Anais do IX Workshop Catarinense de Indicação Geográfica & Mostra de Produtos Tradicionais (no prelo). Lages/SC, 2023.

RICARDO, David. Princípios de economia política e de tributação. 4. ed. Lisboa: Fundação Calouste Gulbenkian, 2001.

ROUX, E.;VOLLET, D.; PECQUEUR, B.. Coordinationsd'acteurs et valorisation des ressourcesterritoriales. Lescas de l'Aubrac et desBaronnies. ÉconomieRurale [Enligne], 293 | Mai-juin 2006, mis enlignele 05 juin 2008. Disponível em: https://www.cairn.info/revue-economie-rurale-2006-3-page-20.htm. Acesso em ago. 2023.DOI: 10.4000/economierurale.776.

SABOURIN, E. Desenvolvimento rural e abordagem territorial. In: SABOURIN, E.; SOUZA, Marcelo Lopes de. Mudar a Cidade: uma introdução crítica ao planejamento e à gestão urbanos, Rio de Janeiro, Bertrand Brasil, 2002.



Ivoneti da Silva Ramos – Valério Alécio Turnes – Ademir Antônio Cazella – Bernard Pecqueur

TECCHIO, A.; CAPELLESSO, A. J.; DORIGON, C.; CAZELLA, A. A.. Desenvolvimento Territorial no Extremo Oeste de Santa Catarina: a Abordagem da Cesta de Bens e Serviços Territoriais. Revista Política e Planejamento Regional. Rio de Janeiro, vol. 8, nº 1, janeiro a abril de 2021. Disponível em: https://lemate.paginas.ufsc.br/files/2019/04/Cesta-e-desenvolvimento-territorial\_formatado.pdf. Acesso em fev. 2024. TURNES, V., CAZELLA, A. A., PECQUEUR, B., GUZZATTI, T. C. Monitoramento de uma Cesta De Bens e Serviços Territoriais: a construção de um painel de indicadores. Raízes: Revista De Ciências Sociais e Econômicas, 42(1), 224–240, 2022.DOI:https://doi.org/10.37370/raizes.2022.v42.784 .

# **Corresponding author**

Ivoneti da Silva Ramos Universidade do Estado de Santa Catarina – Udesc Av. Me. Benvenuta, 2007 – Itacorubi, Florianópolis/SC, Brasil ivoneti.ramos@udesc.br

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons license.

